

Management Board

The confirmed minutes of the fourth meeting held at 9.00 on Wednesday 4th November 2009 via video-conference in meeting room 8, John Bull Building, Tamar Science Park, Plymouth, the WK Norman Conference Room, St Luke's campus, University of Exeter and F10, Knowledge Spa, Truro.

Attendees

Peninsula College of Medicine and Dentistry	Professor Liz Kay (in the Chair) Interim College Dean
South West Ambulance Services Trust	Sarah Black Research and Audit Manager
Peninsula CLAHRC	Professor Nicky Britten Lead for PPI ¹ and Evaluation
NHS Devon	Steve Brown Assistant Director of Public Health
Northern Devon Healthcare NHS Trust	Dr Mark Cartmel Clinical Lead for Research
Peninsula CLAHRC	Professor Mike Depledge Lead for Environment & Human Health
Peninsula College of Medicine and Dentistry	Professor Peta Foxall Director of Graduate Education Programmes
South Devon Healthcare NHS Trust	Sasha Karakusevic Director of Performance & Development
Peninsula CLAHRC	Professor Willem Kuyken Theme Lead Representative
Peninsula CLAHRC	Professor Stuart Logan Director
Peninsula Dental School	Professor David Moles Director, Postgraduate Research & Training
Plymouth Hospitals NHS Trust	Paul Roberts Chief Executive
PenCLAHRC	Professor Ken Stein Deputy Director (Exeter)
University of Plymouth	Professor Richard Stephenson Dean, Faculty of Health & Pro Vice-Chancellor
Torbay Care Trust	Louise Wilson Public Health
NHS South West	Nikki Woodward Interim Assistant Director of Finance
Peninsula CLRN	Professor Tony Woolf Clinical Director
Secretary to the Management Board	Helen Papworth Operational & Finance Manager

¹ Public and Patient Involvement
hpapworth

Apologies:

NHS South West	John Bewick Director of Strategic Development
Cornwall Partnership Trust	Lezli Boswell Chief Executive
Royal Cornwall Hospitals NHS Trust	Peter Colclough Chief Executive
Torbay Care Trust	Anthony Farnsworth Chief Executive
Peninsula CLAHRC	Professor Bob Freeman Locality Lead representative
NHS Plymouth	Debra Lapthorne Director of Public Health
NHS Cornwall	Felicity Owen Director of Public Health*
Royal Devon and Exeter NHS Foundation Trust	Dr Vaughan Pearce Joint Medical Director
NHS Devon	Dr Virginia Pearson Director of Public Health
Peninsula College of Medicine and Dentistry	Professor Sir John Tooke College Dean
Devon Partnership Trust	Iain Tulley Chief Executive
University of Plymouth	Professor Mary Watkins Deputy Vice Chancellor

* Due to technical difficulties, Felicity Owen was unable to join the meeting via telephone conference.

01/09-10 Terms of Reference and Membership

APPROVED:

The draft Terms of Reference and Membership of the Peninsula CLAHRC Management Board for academic year 2009/10 (PCMB 01/09-10).

02/09-10 Minutes

APPROVED:

The minutes of the third meeting of the Peninsula CLAHRC Management Board held on Wednesday 19th June 2009 (PCMB 02/09-10).

03/09-10 Matters Arising

- (a) PCMD Graduate School (minute 26/08-09 (a) (xiii))

NOTED:

The attendance of Professor Peta Foxall, Director of Graduate Education Programmes, PCMD Graduate School.

- (b) Health Innovation and Education Clusters (minute 25/08-09 (f))

RECEIVED:

An oral update from Sasha Karakusevic, noting:

- (i) That the bid had now been submitted.
- (iii) That the model adopted by the south west would bring significant benefits to the region through the strengthening of connections between health and education partners to improve service delivery and patient outcomes.

RESOLVED:

That Professor Mathieson, Sasha Karakusevic, Peter Aitken and Laura Colquon be thanked for their efforts to develop the bid.

04/08-09 Governance

CONSIDERED:

- (a) An oral report from the Director describing the activities of the PenCLAHRC Executive Group since the last meeting, noting:
- (i) That, with the completion of the first, pilot Question Generation and Prioritisation process (see minute 06/09-10 (a)) and preparations for the first annual report, a process of work planning and resource identification was being undertaken to inform the coming year's activities.
 - (ii) That, alongside the original four projects initiated in the first year, PenCLAHRC had adopted a small number of existing research projects that aligned with the Collaboration's overall strategy.
 - (iii) That PenCLAHRC had received additional funding from primary care trusts for a mathematical modeller to provide technical support for the local Health Technology Assessment Commissioning Group (HTACG) in making commissioning decisions regarding new interventions.

- (iv) That, the post of Deputy Director had been offered to the successful candidate and negotiations were underway regarding terms and conditions.
- (v) That it had been agreed that the Collaboration would operate more effectively with a further Deputy in the east of the region, and Professor Ken Stein had taken up this role.
- (vi) That Dr Richard Byng had been recently appointed as Senior Lecturer in Primary Care in Plymouth. A number of research fellows had also been recruited to support projects in child health, falls prevention and depression.
- (vii) That three posts were currently being advertised; a Chair in Health Economics, a Senior Lecturer in Medical Statistics, and a Chair in Diabetes, the latter initially funded by PenCLAHRC with clinical sessions provided by Plymouth Hospitals NHS Trust from next financial year.
- (viii) That two Project Facilitators had been appointed to support the project management of PenCLAHRC projects and help to bring the delivery of outputs closer to the timescales expected by the NHS.
- (ix) That the six part-time locality leads had now been appointed, with formal confirmation regarding the final two individuals from NHS Cornwall received on 3rd November 2009.
- (x) That the protracted recruitment process had demonstrated the difficulties of establishing the PenCLAHRC infrastructure within trusts, given that the activity was not core business for the NHS.
- (xi) That Professor Nicky Britten was leading the internal formative evaluation of PenCLAHRC and that, in September 2009, the Executive Group had received the first stage report based on qualitative interviews with stakeholders.
- (xii) That key members of the PenCLAHRC organisation were meeting in mid November 2009 to address the action points raised in the report.
- (xiii) That the national evaluation research activities, funded by the NIHR's Service Delivery and Organisation programme, were commencing in early 2010 with a joint meeting of researchers which Professor Britten, Professor Rod Sheaff and PenCLAHRC's newly appointed Research Fellow, Dr Janet Heaton, would be attending.

- (b) An oral report from the Director as Lead for the University of Exeter's Science Strategy Translational Medicine Theme, noting:
- (i) That as part of this £1.6M matched funding investment over three years, Melvyn Hillsdon had recently joined the School of Sport and Health Sciences as an Associate Professor with an interest in behaviour change and physical activity whilst Katarina Kos had joined PCMD as a Senior Lecturer in diabetic medicine.
 - (ii) That a working group led by Professor Nicky Britten had reconsidered the proposed Chair in Behaviour Change post and expanded its focus to encompass expertise in individual and organisational change.
 - (iii) That, with additional funding from PCMD and the University of Exeter, a recruitment programme had been designed with the intention of attracting a research group in this area.

RESOLVED:

That the Operational and Finance Manager would investigate how academic staff contact details and information regarding their fields of expertise could be made readily available to partners.

RECEIVED:

- (c) A summary of the main business of the meetings of the PenCLAHRC Executive Group since June 2009 (PCMB 03/09-10).
- (d) The minutes of the University of Exeter's Science Strategy Translational Medicine Management Board meeting held on 30th June 2009 (PCMB 04/09-10).

05/09-10 Reporting and Performance Management**RECEIVED:**

The template for the first annual report to NIHR, covering the period 1st October 2008 – 30th September 2009 (PCMB 05/09-10), noting:

- (a) That NIHR had advised that the first year report was expected to demonstrate a baseline against which future years' performance would be judged.

- (b) That, in addition, the report also required a progress report against the exemplar projects described in the original bid document.

06/09-10 Development of the [Engagement by Design](#)[®] model

RECEIVED:

- (a) Question Generation and Prioritisation

CONSIDERED:

A report from Professor Ken Stein, Lead for Question Generation and Prioritisation (column 1) (PCMB 06/09-10), noting:

- (i) That the first pilot Question Generation and Prioritisation process had been completed with the majority of feedback collected confirming overall satisfaction.
- (ii) That the initial collection of potential research questions was supplemented with submissions using an online tool, which locality leads had promoted in a series of workshops with clinicians, resulting in over 100 topics.
- (iii) That Executive Group considered 40 of these questions in a three-hour session and selected 12 for further consideration by a wider stakeholder group.
- (iv) That the Evidence Synthesis Team produced priority briefs for the twelve questions which were reviewed by the Stakeholder Prioritisation Panel at a face-to-face meeting in Plymouth using the prioritisation criteria previous agreed by the Management Board.
- (v) That representatives of each organisation with PenCLAHRC had been invited Stakeholder Prioritisation Panel, which resulted in a good cross-section of the collaboration as a whole, plus patient representatives, which had been successfully facilitated by Andy Gibson, PenCLAHRC's PPI Research Fellow.
- (vi) That, as the object of the exercise had not been to achieve consensus, the questions were ranked in order of preference based on individual members' votes, the outcome of which was presented as appendix 3 to the report.

- (vii) That six questions had been selected as the next phase of PenCLAHRC projects, pending confirmation by the Management Board in accordance with paper PCPB 06/08-09 agreed by the original Project Board in September 2008.
- (viii) That, of the remaining 12 questions, a number had generated significant interest with the stakeholders and, as a result, specific actions had been identified by PenCLAHRC to progress these through wider consultation with other interested parties in NHS Trusts and/or the two universities.
- (ix) That, in addition, question submitter were encouraged to utilise the NIHR's Health Technology Assessment suggestion system (<http://www.hta.ac.uk/suggest/index.shtml>), the UK Database of Uncertainties about the Effects of Treatments (UK DUETs <http://www.library.nhs.uk/DUETs/Default.aspx>), or to resubmit to the process after further development supported by the locality leads.
- (x) That, although this was a pilot process, it was noted that a number of questions had been originated by patients and/or carers, supported by research networks or charities. One of the recommendations included a review of the online tool to facilitate wider access by non-clinical and non-academic groups.
- (xi) That a further recommendation was the decoupling of the process from the meetings of Management Board to facilitate greater preparation of research questions supported by the locality leads and increased time for production of priority briefs between the stages of prioritisation, as well as permitting more frequent meetings of the Stakeholder Prioritisation Panel if required.
- (xii) That it was appropriate for the Management Board to maintain its role in overseeing the portfolio of PenCLAHRC projects to ensure that the decisions of the Stakeholder Prioritisation Panel were aligned with the strategic direction of the Collaboration.

APPROVED:

The recommendations of paper PCMB 06/09-10, as follows:

- A That the question generation web tool would be reviewed to improve accessibility to public or lay users.

- B That the first stage, Executive Group prioritisation would be held face to face.
- C That the priority process should not be contingent on the Management Board meeting.
- D That the priority briefings would be reviewed and improved.

(b) The Environment and Human Health theme

RECEIVED:

A presentation from Professor Mike Depledge, Lead of the Environment and Human Health theme, entitled "The emerging theme of Environment and Human Health: an update" (PCMB 07/09-10, tabled at meeting), noting:

- (i) That the Environment and Human Health theme represented a new departure for the health service which would not be able to overlook the impact of climate change, combined with the significant public interest in environmental issues, during its next development phase.
- (ii) That the £12M bid to the EU's Convergence fund to establish an Environment and Human Health Institute in Truro had recently been approved and would provide six new academic staff, eight post-doctoral positions and twelve Phd studentships.
- (iii) That the initial staffing for the theme was due to be supplemented with a new post-doctoral post starting in early 2010, whilst two other lectureships were being advertised alongside a teaching fellow to develop a new Masters degree.
- (iv) That the Environment and Human Health theme within PenCLAHRC was focused specifically on how health and wellbeing was derived or could be improved using the natural environment.
- (v) That it had been agreed with Professor Ken Stein that PenCLAHRC would undertake a systematic review on a focused research question looking at the natural environment, physical activity and obesity.

(c) Public and Patient Involvement

RECEIVED:

A report from Professor Nicky Britten, Lead for Public and Patient Involvement (PCMB 08/09-10), noting:

- (i) That the aim of the public and patient involvement strategy was to embed meaningful involvement within all PenCLAHRC projects, and that this had been initially resourced with the appointment of a dedicated Research Fellow, Andy Gibson.
- (ii) That a key principle was to avoid duplicating or reinventing existing work considering the many excellent initiatives already underway within the region.
- (iii) That a patient and carer group was being established with the following aims;
 - To have strategic overview of all PPI activities within PenCLAHRC
 - To ensure that this was being addressed by all projects
 - To coordinate approaches to PPI, and,
 - To provide an opportunity for shared learning.
- (iv) That draft Terms of Reference would be considered at a first meeting in mid-November, and would include the nomination of an external advisor from the NHS National Centre for Involvement to act as a mediator in the event of disputes.
- (v) That nationally, a network had been established with other PPI practitioners and researchers within the CLAHRCs, including attendance at the recent Learning Event in London.
- (vi) That PenCLAHRC would be represented at a National Coordinating Centre for Engagement event in Bristol, which was primarily focused on higher education institutions.
- (vii) That a paper for the Journal of Social Science and Medicine describing the proposed PenCLAHRC PPI model was in preparation, as well as a joint research bid to the NIHR and MRC, led by the University of Lancaster.

07/09-10 Risk Management

CONSIDERED:

The Risk Register for the Peninsula CLAHRC (PCMB 09/09-10), noting:

- (a) That members were encouraged to pass any comments or amendments on the risk register as a whole to the Secretary for inclusion in the version produced monthly for consideration by the Executive Group.
- (b) That risk 1, failure of PenCLAHRC to achieve buy-in from NHS organisations, remained a concern but that it was likely that the situation would improve over time, particularly given the recruitment of the locality leads.
- (c) That it was important for PenCLAHRC to demonstrate to NHS partners other innovative ways in which research could help to deliver improved services and greater efficiency, such as the work for the local HTACG.
- (d) That risk 2, PenCLAHRC partners fail to provide committed matched funding resources, was reliant on the development of systems for documenting and capturing activity within the Trusts themselves.
- (e) That, with confirmation of the EU Convergence funding hopefully before the next financial year, the likelihood of this risk would reduce.
- (f) That risk 3, Failure to identify and agree with stakeholders relevant quantitative and qualitative outcomes for PenCLAHRC, should be reduced once an action plan had been drawn up following the review of the internal evaluation report (minute 04/09-10 (a) (iix) refers).
- (g) That risk 4, Inability to operate effectively within partner organisations due to barriers at middle management level, would be mitigated by exploring the issues with a small group of Management Board members from NHS trusts.
- (h) That risk 6, Active or perceived disenfranchisement of potential stakeholders, including practitioner-led disciplines and non-health academics, and locations with weaker historic involvement in medical school-led research, was being mitigated with specific reference to activities in Plymouth and Exeter, and that this would need to be expanded across the region.

RESOLVED:

- (i) That, with reference to risk 4, the Director would have an initial discussion with Sasha Karakusevic regarding methods by which barriers at middle management levels within NHS trusts could be overcome.
- (j) That the likelihood of risk 5, Failure to recruit high calibre key staff e.g. Deputy Director, senior academic appointments, clinical locality leads, recruitment of staff, would be reduced given recent confirmation of several senior posts and the confidence expressed by the Director regarding in the current recruitment round.

08/09-10 Project Plan

RECEIVED:

The Project Plan for the Peninsula CLAHRC (PCMB 10/09-10), noting:

- (a) That the plan reflected the key elements of the Director's oral report, including progress with recruitment.
- (b) That the new Project Facilitators would be developing individual project plans for the six prioritised research questions.

09/09-10 Date of Next Meeting

REPORTED:

That the next meeting of the PenCLAHRC Management Board would be held on Wednesday 21st April 2010, 1400 – 1600, in meeting room 8, the John Bull Building, Tamar Science Park, Plymouth, and the WK Norman Conference Room, PMS Building, St Luke's Campus, University of Exeter.